

**“A GOOD INDIAN IS
A DEAD INDIAN”**

(PHUMLANE MFEKA)



**A SIGN
OF
ALLAH'S
ATHAAB**

Published By:
The Majlisul Ulama of S.A
PO Box 3393
Port Elizabeth
6056
South Africa

**OUR COMMENTS ON MAULANA KHALID
DORAT'S ARTICLE:
*"A Good Indian Is A Dead Indian"***

We reproduce Muhtaram Maulana Khalid Dhorat's article and tender our comments and advice for the benefit of the Muslim community, and for a correct appraisal of the problems facing Muslims, and the solution thereof.

MAULANA DHORAT'S ARTICLE

**A Good Indian Is A
Dead Indian**

9 November 2015

Sunday morning is the one morning in the week that everyone looks forward to. If the Sunday morning sleep is disturbed, the whole week is disturbed. And this is exactly what happened on Sunday, 25th Oct '15. As the Sunday Tribune was being distributed early that morning, a person who was returning from Fajr salaah decided to stop at a service station. He spotted, to his utter dismay, an article on Phumlani Mfeka, who had only recently tweeted: "A good Indian is a dead Indian." Mfeka who heads the "Injeje Yamanguni" in KwaZulu Natal, was quoted as saying: "We as Africans have remained silent for far too long whilst Indians continue to exploit, abuse and monopolize everything in the land of our forefathers. Just like our forefathers in 1949 and '85, we now also have to rather die than to be the symbol of poverty in our own land, a curtain

of blood must veil the whole of KZN so that the blood of our ancestors can attain justice or we die fighting for it. This Indian hegemony MUST end!"

As no Indian wanted to be burnt alive in their beds that morning, the sheer heat of such a hateful and racially inciting message got everyone to an early start: "What's going on with that buffoon?," everyone asked. Ebrahim Gangat managed to interview Mfeka on CII, and Dr. Faizel Suliman of SAMNET also managed to pull together various stakeholders to address this issue in Durban which seems to have just popped out of the blue for many. Many local and overseas 'Ulema also offered their advice on the situation, some of whom predicted the occurrence of "dark clouds looming on the horizon" some 30 years ago already. For now, the situation seems to be under control, but everyone is tensed.

The situation being temporarily under control for now does not mean that the burning issues that led to such hateful remarks have disappeared. No, it rather affords us a chance to seriously address the underlying issues. If they are ignored this time, the next time round there will be no newspaper headlines to alert us. We certainly do not want a repeat of the Cato Manor riots of 1949 whence Indian landlords were accused of rent-hikes and forced overcrowding of Africans. The riots sparked off on 13 January 1949 when an Indian stallholder on Grey Street caught an African boy stealing. He was punished for the offence. In response, Africans started looting Indian residences and businesses. In consequence, Indian landowners lost their properties to African shack lords and traders. The riots continued with mobs roaming Cato Manor, viciously assaulting Indian residents. There were 6

000 shacks in the area that housed between 45 000 – 50 000 people. It took the authorities two days to defuse the situation, which had resulted in 137 deaths and left several thousand critically injured. It was only in May 1980 that the area was gazetted for Indian occupation again, but 1985 again was the scene of vicious anti-Indian riots in Durban. Mfeka's threats pointed towards these two incidents – if Indians were looted and assaulted in the past, the same can happen to them in the future, only on a larger scale.

Seeds of the Situation

Outwardly, it seems that the inciteful remarks by Mfeka, an outstanding entrepreneur and board member of many enterprises, seems to be racially motivated and aimed at only enriching himself, but let us play the ball, and not the man, on this one. Theatrics aside, on the ground, our African brothers have made some serious allegations against Indian Muslims which need to be analyzed. These basically fall into three broad categories:

- 1) **Muslim Charities:** Our African brothers lament the fact that Muslims collect huge sums of money in their name, and then distribute these mostly overseas. Many a time, a great show is made of it in the media, whilst the locals are afflicted with grinding poverty. In addition, many members of these charities spend colossal amounts of money in travelling and accommodation alone – money which can be better utilized locally. They wish that government should seize control of all Muslim NGOs, including halaal certifying bodies like SANHA and MJC, so that the monies collected be channeled to them via their own structures;

2) **Unfair Labour Practices:** This seems to be the most serious, and levllled at all Indians, not only Muslims. Our African brothers allege that many Africans employed by Indians are grossly underpaid – some as low as R27- a day. Many are verbally abused, sexually exploited, never given proper contracts and unfairly dismissed on short notice. Some are never paid their dues or given annual increases, whilst others are forced to offer sexual favours just to keep their job. Sometimes unrealistic expectations are placed on them like ridiculously long working hours and conforming to a certain dress-code when they cannot even afford normal clothing. Derogatory terms like “kaarya” are used when referring to them and they are fed with the left-over scraps from the previous day;

3) **Control of Township Institutions:** Although many Masjids and Madrasahs have been built in the Townships by Indian Muslims, they wield an iron fist over their administration. The local congregants have absolutely no say in their running, no donations is accepted from the locals, and nor can they do collections for their own Masjid. Even if they want to contribute a bar of soap, they can not do so. It’s also alleged that African Imams and Muezzins are paid a pittance too. In short, Indians regard African Muslims as incapable workers and potential thieves who need to be monitored all the time. These sentiments have become so inflamed that many individuals and organizations have ALREADY pulled out from the Townships and have left their structures to the locals to administer.

Are all the above grievances mainly due to jealousy at the affluence of some Indians, or is there some merit

in them? This I leave for the readers to decide for themselves. If after introspection there are any shortcomings on our part, they need to be remedied immediately. But on the flipside, our African brothers have some serious misconceptions about Indian Muslims, which have led them to act and behave irrationally on many occasions. Generally, they regard all Indian Muslims as "Guptas" (super-rich), who owe them all the wealth they possess i.e. mentality of entitlement. They do not know that amongst Indians too, there are many who struggle just to make ends meet, and that wealth is a product of hard work. This analogy is then taken dangerously further: if the Indians do not willfully give up their wealth, they will either rob and murder them for it, or will pull a "Ugandan-style "Idi Amien" stunt on them and chase them out the land. Further, they erroneously think that if Indians can run a Masjid and feeding-schemes in their Townships, they have lots of spare cash lying around. Why should Indians do the collection, they can also do a collection and administrate their own structures?

The Facts

To set the record straight, there are currently more monies being expended locally amongst both the Muslim and non-Muslim population, than overseas. Feeding schemes, clinics, schools, religious institutes etc have been operated for dozens of years in SA. However, the painful lesson we learn from this is that true brotherhood and loyalty cannot be bought by hampers and millions alone. We have realized that charity is merely a device for alleviating the plight of the poor, but for genuine brotherhood, we need to have genuine sincerity, affection and humility – free of

prejudice and racism. We need to live amongst the poor, marry amongst them, speak their language, share their troubles, and change our da'wah (missionary) strategies in order to rid the locals of their prejudices for their Indian brothers.

Further, sending charities overseas is not a sign of preferring others over the locals. Muslims believe in universal brotherhood, so man-made borders will not hinder them from helping their brothers as far afield as Japan or Haiti. One should not feel aggrieved if someone else is also being helped... we all equally make up the creation of God. Unlike tax, charities are a voluntary contribution, so the individual has a choice of where to donate as per Qur'anic injunction. The government has no jurisdiction on this area of spending.

As to the charge of unfair labour practices by Indians; some are guilty as hell, but this problem is not specific to Indians – it's not a race issue. Many Indians ill-treat fellow Indians too, and exploit them to the bone. It's a sickness of capitalism and greed, not race, and many have paid with their life for it. Africans also murder and ill-treat fellow Africans, and the economy of South Africa is still largely in the hands of the whites – it has never been dominated by Indians. Many an Indian businessman or housewife has been brutally murdered by their workers or domestic due to their foul tongue and exploitation. They paid the ultimate price for their evil practices, but the law must treat each case on its individual merit. Everyone, no matter what race, should be equal before the law.

As to the last charge, it must be known that people of the Townships often feel the worst brunt of poverty.

As foreigners seek to survive in an environment of scarcity, the locals have come to regard everyone as their enemy: the Pakistanis are branded as evil due to their practice of car jamming/hijackings, ATM bombings, and marrying the locals and then dumping them. The Zimbabweans are being blamed for cable theft and house burglaries, the Somalis for being intolerant and running spaza shops wherein goods are sold at giveaway prices, and the Nigerians are accused of immorality due to their drug peddling, gold smuggling and prostitution houses. The racism displayed against Indians falls into these broader xenophobic tendencies.

Agreed, Indians are control-freaks. They would like to know exactly what their wives are doing at any second of the day, and they also want to control the social lives of their employees. Likewise, if they establish a Masjid, they would like to run it as per their desire – full strings attached. However, giving charity and building Masjids is an age-old ancestral tradition amongst them to keep Islam alive, not to control other nations. So if the Indian and the Black Committee cannot work in harmony, the Indians should gracefully cut the strings and back down as charities are given solely for the pleasure of the Almighty. No matter who runs the Masjid, the function of the Masjid should still continue.

Lastly, as our government fails to address the question of unemployment, rampant corruption, and mass poverty in South Africa, the masses will look to blame or attack any juicy fruit which may be within their reach. Let us emphasize with the poor, stop our dirty exploitative practices, and reduce our standard of living. Let's drive a car for its drive, not its looks,

and stay in a house for shelter, not to pronounce our status. Extravagance must be given up in all forms. Remember that sometimes money can be a curse, so let it not become such in this instance.

OUR COMMENTS AND ADVICE

Muhtaram Dhorat's first fundamental error is the deletion of Allah's Name, Allah's naseehat, Allah's warnings, and Rasulullah's guidance from his appraisal and proffered solutions. Any discourse of a Muslim, which is devoid of Allah's Name, and which skirts the prescriptions and solutions proffered and commanded by the Qur'aan and Sunnah, are doomed to failure. Never will any suggested solution / prescription be of any avail if the actual cause of the problem is not addressed, and if the Qur'aanic and Sunnah prescription and solution are not adopted by Muslims.

While Maulana Dhorat Sahib has highlighted some ills of the Muslim community, he has failed to understand the cause of the diseases, hence the proffered solution is not a solution at all, and it will have no beneficial effect. If the Muslim community spends billions on services and projects for the under-privileged, it will make no difference for the simple reason that the looming threat of pillage, plunder and murder is a sign of Allah's impending Athaab for a community of Muslims totally immersed in gross and flagrant immorality – fisq, fujoor, bid'ah and even kufr.

Those who exploit, do so because they have abandoned the Sunnah culture of Islam, and the western kuffaar culture which Muslims have adopted is being promoted by the active connivance and even adoption of the vast majority of molvis and sheikhs, even khaanqah sheikhs.

Rasulullah (sallallahu alayhi wasallam) has clarified to us that when Muslims turn their back on the Deen, then Allah Ta'ala will create weakness in our hearts and instil into our hearts fear for the kuffaar, and Allah Ta'ala will allow the kuffaar to pillage and plunder us and our institutions be these of the status of Musjidul Aqsa. The Qur'aan and Ahaadith clearly testify to the fact that Allah's Athaab will overtake us when the point of no return in our orgies of fisq and fujoor has been traversed.

Allah Ta'ala says: *“And no one but He (Allah) knows the armies of your Rabb.”*

Be it well understood that the kuffaar too are among the Armies of Allah Azza Wa Jal. Furthermore, not a leaf stirs or drops from a tree and not an atom moves, but with the direct intervention and command of Allah Azza Wa Jal. Maulana Dhorat Sahib has forgotten this irrefutable transcendental Truth. Our Imaan demands that we believe in this fact of the Deen. When not a leaf can stir without His command, then Mr. Phumlani's threats can materialize only with Allah's command. Now when this is the reality, then the only way of averting the expected calamity, is to address the cause and to remedy it.

The cause is undoubtedly, the gross disobedience of Muslims and their flagrant indulgence in and justification of immorality in which even the Ulama are involved in no small measure. The solution is to please Allah Azza Wa Jal, and He will do the rest for our safety and security. Surely Muhtaram Maulana Dhorat Sahib is aware that Rasulullah (sallallahu alayhi wasallam) had said that if all mankind and jinkind unite to grant you any benefit, they can collectively do so only to the extent of the benefit ordained by Allah Azza Wa Jal, and conversely, if all mankind and jinkind united to harm you, they can collectively harm you only to the degree ordained by Allah Azza Wa Jal. Entire creation is a shadow – powerless to do anything without Allah's command. The bottom line is total submission to Allah's Shariah

and adoption of the Sunnah Culture of Rasulullah (sallallahu alayhi wasallam). Then no one can harm us, and then there is no need to fear the shadows and the barking and the howling of the enemies. This is precisely what Allah Ta'ala says in the Qur'aan Majeed:

“If you have Sabr and adopt Taqwa, then never can their plot harm you in the least bit.”

This has to be the Imaan of Muslims. Minus Imaan in this Qur'aanic fact, one ceases to be a Mu'min.

Muhtaram Maulana Dhorat Sahib, offering a solution in expectation of averting Mr. Phumlani's threat, avers: *“We need to live amongst the poor, marry amongst them, speak their language, share their troubles, and change our da'wah strategies in order to rid the locals of their prejudices for their Indian brothers.”*

We do not know where the respected Maulana Sahib lives nor do we know if he has married amongst them. It is entirely wrong to suggest that issues of a personal nature, such as marriage, which Allah Ta'ala has left to the choices of families, tribes and nations be overridden and politicized and used as a strategy to allay fears and ward off threats. The Qur'aan Majeed explicitly says:

“O People! Verily We have made your (created you) as clans and tribes so that you mutually recognize one another. Verily, the noblest of you by Allah, is the most pious one.”

Marrying within the clan/tribe is the natural pattern created by Allah Ta'ala for perpetuating the variety of nations created by Allah Azza Wa Jal. Marriage beyond the clan/tribal boundary is the exception. It is not the norm. It is a lawful exception. It is un-Islamic to propagate a system which upsets the natural order

created by Allah Azza Wa Jal. This advice of Maulana Dhorat should not have featured in his naseehat which anyhow is unrelated to the actual cause and the true and valid solution.

The prejudices and exploitation to which he has alluded are the effects of abandonment of Islam. As long as Islamic culture is not adopted – as long as emulation of the kuffaar is not shunned – the evils in the community will remain.

It is not our concern that Mr. Phumlani has singled out Indians for his venomous threat whilst such evils are found in all communities and vastly emphasized in his own community by his own people. This is not our concern. Our concern should be only to submit to Allah Azza Wa Jal in the way the Qur'aan and Sunnah command. Allah Ta'ala will then turn the tables. The fundamental error in Maulana Dhorat's proffered remedy as well as the solutions offered by all other reformers of our era is that Allah Ta'ala is unceremoniously deleted from the equation. A completely blind eye – or blind eyes – are cast on the diagnosis and prescription offered by Allah Azza Wa Jal and Rasulullah (sallallahu alayhi wasallam).

The propensity to share in the troubles of others is the effect of submission to Allah Ta'ala, and the meaning of such submission is adoption of the Sunnah and self-reformation - Islaah of the Nafs. Minus these essential ingredients, the Muslim's lifestyle will be no different from the kuffaar way of life, and that is precisely the malady of the Ummah today. Rasulullah's *ta'leem* mirrored in the following Hadith is no longer an attribute of Muslims:

“Muslims are like one person. If the eye pains, the whole body is affected, and if the head pains, the whole body is affected.”

This type of *Ukhuwwat (Brotherhood)* is possible only if *Islaah* of the *nafs* is accomplished. No amount of superficial ‘unity’ conferences and slogans will create love and brotherhood. This is a *Ni’mat* bestowed by Allah Ta’ala, and it is granted only as a consequence of submission unto Him. Thus Allah Ta’ala states in the *Qur’aan Majeed*:

“If you (O Muhammad!) had to spend whatever (wealth) there is on earth, you will not be able to instil love in their hearts. But it is Allah Who instils loves in them.”

These Aayaat and Ahaadith are cited for serious reflection, not for a cursory glance. Meditate on these Statements of Allah Ta’ala and understand what exactly Allah Ta’ala conveys to us.

Muhtaram Maulana Dhorat Sahib says: *“Agreed, Indians are control-freaks. They would like to know exactly what their wives are doing at any second of the day.....”* What is so ‘freak’ about this? What wrong does Maulana Sahib discern in this patriarchal attitude of Muslims or Indian Muslims, and why is this valid and lawful patriarchy presented as if it belongs exclusively to Indian Muslims? Genuine Muslim husbands have what is termed *ghayrat* which is an attribute of Imaan. It is Imaani honour.

We are not members of the western *kuffaar* culture in which *dayyoosiyat* is an outstanding feature. Being a cuckold is an abhorrent quality for a Muslim. The *ghayrat* of Muslim husbands – those who are true Muslims – is in entirety unrelated to the issue which forms the subject of Maulana Dhorat’s article. It is not something which should have been introduced in a topic of this nature.

Maulana Dhorat Sahib’s penultimate advice reads:

“Let us emphasize with the poor, stop our dirty exploitive practices, and reduce our standard of living. Let’s drive a car for

its drive, not its looks, and stay in a house for shelter, not to pronounce our status.

Extravagance must be given up in all forms. Remember that sometimes money can be a curse, so let it not become such in this instance.”

It is a pity that the honourable Maulana Sahib is proffering these advices at this late stage when threats are being made, and then too, without a Deeni base. *Zuhd* is the *ta’leem* of the Sunnah, and it has different degrees of applications in Muslim society. These are issues which the Ulama should always propagate from the Mimbar and in general in their talks to the community. But these issues are never discussed because of worldly and nafsani considerations. *Zuhd* has to be practised as an injunction of the Sunnah, not in consideration of threats by the kuffaar. It is part of Islaah of the nafs which has been excised from our lives. The nafs of the community is rotten and this rottenness is promoted by the ulama in general. The heart and brain of the Ummah (the Ulama and the Khaanqah Shaikhs) are diseased, hence the Ummah is rotten to the core.

Money which is a Ni’mat of Allah, is transformed into a ‘curse’ by our own villainy which in turn is the consequence of having abandoned the Deen, otherwise money is a valuable bounty with which to purchase the Akhirah. Thus, Rasulullah (sallallahu alayhi wasallam) said: “*Saalih maal (halaal wealth) is good for a Saalih (pious) man.*” He further said: “*The truthful, honest trader (on the Day of Qiyaamah) will be with the Ambiya, the Siddiqueen and the Shuhada.*”

Since there is no emphasis on moral reformation, and since total emulation of the kuffaar life style has become our culture, Allah’s punishment must be expected to arrive as sure as night follows day.

It is the Waajib obligation of the Ulama to constantly highlight the condition of the Ummah in the light of the Qur'aan and Sunnah, not in the backdrop of threats and hallucinations. But, 90% of the Ulama are silent because they themselves are the victims of nafsaniyat. They misuse the Deen for the attainment of worldly goals.

Mr. Phumlani's threat has created considerable disturbance and even sent shock waves in the community, hence Muhtaram Maulana Dhorat Sahib deemed it appropriate to write his article of advice. Did the immorality of Muslim women prowling the street ever sent shock waves in the community? Did the Ulama react Islamically to the deluge of fisq and fujoor in which the community is sinking? Why do the Ulama not condemn the haraam riba practices of the so-called Islamic banks? Why are the Ulama silent about the halaalization of carrion? Why are the Ulama accepting all the radio stations of shaitaan? Why are they promoting all the evil practices rampant in the community with their silence?

Why are the Ulama compromising with baatil – such as the baatil of the bid'ah of the Qabar Pujaaris, the baatil of the MJC and the baatil of other miscreants with whom they are at pains to strike up an imaginary, false unity, and in this process they water down the Haqq whilst the baatil of the deviants gain ascendancy? As a direct consequence of truckling and bootlicking the people of baatil, the Ulama who are supposed to be the Standard Bearers of the Haqq have completely abandoned Amr Bil ma'roof Nahy Anil Munkar. Discharge of this Command will obviously not be tolerable to the bid'atis and modernists with whom the miscreant ulama are lying in bed in an unholy embrace, completely shunning Rasulullah's approbrium for Bid'ah:

“Whoever honours a man of Bid'ah, verily he has aided in the destruction of Islam.”

The evil condition in which Muslims are wallowing today is vividly depicted in the following Hadith narrated by Hadhrat Abdullah Ibn Mas'ood (Radhiyallahu anhu).

“How will you be on that day when you are engulfed by such a fitnah which will render your elderly ones senile and your young ones old. People will regard it (the fitnah) as a sunnah. If anything of it the fitnah is omitted, they will say that a sunnah has been discarded.”

(The people asked): “And when will that be?”

(Ibn Mas'ood – Radhiyallahu anhu) said:

“When your (righteous) Ulama have departed (from this world);

When your qaaris are in abundance; when your Fuqaha are few;

When your rulers are in abundance (huge civil services as are prevalent today);

when your honest ones are few;

when your trust-embezzlers are in abundance;

when Knowledge (of the Deen) is acquired for objectives other than the Deen, and when the dunya will be pursued with the amal of the Aakhirat.”

This Hadith adequately mirrors the rotten condition of the ulama and the masses. All are sinking in the quagmire of fisq and fujoor which they have created for themselves. This is the worrying and disturbing factor. The threats such as Mr. Phumlani's threat of pillage, plunder and murder, are the signs of Allah's impending Athaab. Allah Azza Wa Jal is in control of the universe – no one else.

With respect, we must say that Muhtaram Maulana Dhorat's advice is devoid of Islamic ethos. A discourse bereft of Islamic ethos in which features Allah and His Rasool is, according to the

Hadith, a *wabaa* (calamity). The obligation of the Ulama is to steer the Muslim community towards Allah Ta'ala – to remind them of their sins and transgressions – to remind them of Maut and the torments of the Qabar – to remind them of the goals of the Aakhirat - to instil submission and obedience in them with Naseehat intended to cultivate the Pleasure of Allah Ta'ala.

There should be no truckling and bootlicking in our naseehat. Bootlicking portrays the deficiency of Imaan. Allah Ta'ala assures those who are on the Haqq of safety. Those on baatil fear and bootlick. Assuring the followers of the Haqq of Allah's *Nusrat*, the Qur'aan Majeed says about these Phumalani type threats:

“...The Mu'mineen are those who answer Allah and the Rasool after injury (calamity) had befallen them. For those who are virtuous among them and who adopt taqwa is a great reward.

They (the righteous Mu'mineen) are those for whom people (like Mr.Phumalani) said: 'Verily, the people (i.e. the enemy) have gathered against you, therefore fear them.'

(This threat) only increased the Imaan of the Mu'mineen, and They said: 'Allah suffices for us, and He is a wonderful Helper.'”
(Aal-e-Imraan)

No truckling! No bootlicking! *Inaabat ilal laah* (turning to Allah with *Taubah* and in complete submission) is the solution for our plight and problem. May Allah Ta'ala have mercy on this humiliated Ummah – the Ummah which has brought humiliation on itself with its bootlicking emulation of the kuffaar.